

## **HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION MEETING**

City Council Chambers

May 16, 2017

### CALL TO ORDER – ITEM 1:

A regular meeting of the Astoria Historic Landmarks Commission (HLC) was held at the above place at the hour of 5:16 pm.

### ROLL CALL – ITEM 2:

Commissioners Present: Vice President Michelle Dieffenbach, Commissioners Jack Osterberg, Paul Caruana, Mac Burns, Kevin McHone, and Katie Rathmell.

Commissioners Excused: President LJ Gunderson

Staff Present: Community Development Director Kevin Cronin and Planner Nancy Ferber.  
The meeting is recorded and will be transcribed by ABC Transcription Services, Inc.

The Commission continued to Item 4: Presentations at this time.

### APPROVAL OF MINUTES – ITEM 3:

This item was addressed immediately following Item 5: Public Hearings.

#### **Item 3(a): February 21, 2017 Minutes**

Vice President Dieffenbach asked if there were any changes to the minutes. There was none.

Commissioner Caruana moved to approve the minutes of February 21, 2017 as presented; seconded by Commissioner Burns. Motion passed unanimously. Ayes: Vice President Dieffenbach, Commissioners Caruana, Rathmell, Osterberg, Burns, and McHone. Nays: None.

#### **Item 3(b): March 21, 2017 Minutes**

Vice President Dieffenbach asked if there were any changes to the minutes. Commissioner Osterberg noted the following correction:

- Page 2, Paragraph 11, Sentence 2: "Commissioner Osterberg said he had a slight preference towards painted **unpainted** wood."
- Footer – Historic Landmarks Commission, 3-21-16 **3-21-17**

Commissioner Osterberg moved to approve the minutes of March 21, 2017 as corrected; seconded by Commissioner Rathmell. Motion passed 5 to 0 to 2. Ayes: Vice President Dieffenbach, Commissioners Osterberg, Rathmell, and McHone. Nays: None. Abstentions: Commissioners Burns and Caruana.

The Commission continued to Item 6: Reports of Officers at this time.

### PRESENTATIONS – ITEM 4:

This item was addressed immediately following Item 2: Roll Call.

To celebrate Historic Preservation Month, Julie Garver, of Innovative Housing, will give a presentation about the Merwyn Hotel renovation project.

Julie Garver, Housing Development Director, Innovative Housing, LLC, described her company's efforts to purchase the Merwyn Hotel building, provided background information on Innovative Housing, shared details of the company's past projects, and presented their ideas for rehabilitating the Merwyn.

#### PUBLIC HEARINGS:

Vice President Dieffenbach explained the procedures governing the conduct of public hearings to the audience and advised that the substantive review criteria were listed in the Staff report.

#### ITEM 5(a):

EX17-01            Exterior Alteration EX17-01 by Fort George Brewery and Public House, Cervesia Gratis, Inc. to enclose and add a 2<sup>nd</sup> level to patio and to construct an attached sky bridge (to the south) on a historic building at 1483 Duane Street in the C-4, Central Commercial zone.

Vice President Dieffenbach asked if anyone objected to the jurisdiction of the HLC to hear this matter at this time. There were no objections. Vice President Dieffenbach asked if any member of the HLC had a conflict of interest, or any ex parte contacts to declare.

Commissioner Burns said he knew the owners and had eaten at the restaurant, but he had not discussed this project and believed he could be objective.

Commissioner Rathmell stated she knew the owner, who had mentioned the project to her. However, no details were discussed. As soon as she said she was a Historic Landmark Commissioner, the owner ended the conversation. She believed she could be objective.

Vice President Dieffenbach requested a presentation of the Staff report.

Planner Ferber presented the Staff report and recommended approval with conditions. No correspondence had been received.

Commissioner Osterberg asked Staff to specify the type of solid material they recommended for the lites above the roll up doors, which were required in Condition of Approval 1. Planner Ferber stated she could recommend materials, but wanted to leave the design up to the Applicant.

Commissioner Caruana asked if the patio and parking lot were on a separate tax lot from the building. Planner Ferber said historic photos show the lot was vacant and was used as a garbage area.

Commissioner Caruana said many of the downtown buildings were designed to have another building abutting them and this site looks as if it were intended for a building.

Vice President Dieffenbach opened public testimony for the hearing and asked for the Applicant's presentation.

Jack Harris, 190 W. Exchange, Astoria, said he moved to Astoria 20 years ago because he was impressed with the natural beauty, amazing architecture, and the people who lived here. When Fort George was set, he and Chris Nemlowill wanted to start something that their friends and neighbors would proud to say was from Astoria. He gave a slideshow presentation on the history of Fort George Brewery, changes they have made to the west side of the building, and their current plans for the west façade. John Goodenberger has said this building was always meant to accept another building on the west side, but no one ever built next to it. The deck has become one of Astoria's premier outdoor seating areas. The roll-up doors have let a lot of light into the building, which was once very dark inside. They want to expand on these assets so they can contribute more to the community. Currently, the upstairs is only opened on evenings and weekends because the downstairs is most efficient. Occasionally, they must turn people away when the restaurant is crowded. The outside deck was designed for open-air seating, which is great in good weather, but the deck is useless during Astoria's rainy season. They would like to use the deck more often, which will keep their employees working longer. Outdoor seating is very popular and they receive three or four calls a week from people who want to know if their dogs can sit outside. Another benefit of this project will be better flow provided by adding stairs to the courtyard. The stairs will unify



their two buildings by connecting them through the courtyard. The addition of an upper deck will provide incredible views of the river, downtown, and the houses on the hillside. The upper deck will be connected by a bridge to the spiral staircase and the garden ramp, which will also add an egress for safety. They want to continue to use the roll-up doors because they allude to the previous uses of the buildings. Their original proposal for this project was modified based on feedback from Staff. The design will now incorporate 13-inch C channels as posts between the windows on the deck. This mimics the columns at the front of the pub and gives the building the overbuilt look that extends throughout the pub. Galvanized steel rails will be used to connect the upper deck with the spiral staircase and the rail system to the garden. Natural wood rails will be used on top of the upper deck and the handrails of the stairs that lead down to the courtyard. Concrete skirting will extend around the edge of the deck foundation. They have been inspired by the contemporary designs that have been showing up in Astoria over the last few years, so they plan to incorporate some of that into their designs. To bring as much light as possible into their space, they plan to expose the mechanical systems that run the doors, lites, and heaters. Staff has recommended they cover the glass on the roll up doors, but they are not interested in doing so. The 30-inch galvanized steel structure that separates the upper deck from the bottom and the 13-inch C channel really beef up the look of the building and matches with the rest of the building very well. Enclosing the upper windows would cover the mechanical equipment that they want to show off and would make the space darker.

Chris Nemlowill, 478 Kensington, Astoria, said he was proud of this town and was excited to create something that everyone can be part of. They send out beer so that people can come back to Astoria. He has seen Astoria in worse times and when he was growing up people would board up transom windows. He believed having glass lites in the roll-up doors opens the space, especially during the winter. More light in that space makes the environment more comfortable. He appreciated Planner Ferber and Mr. Goodenberger for working with them on this project. He also appreciated the Fort George employees who attended. He was excited about the project and really wanted to keep the glass in the windows.

Commissioner Osterberg asked if the Applicants had considered any other design alternatives to the glass panels.

Mr. Nemlowill stated they preferred glass and have not proposed any other materials. He believed the solid material recommended by Staff could be metal or wood, but either way, it would just look like a boarded up transom window. He feels very strongly that glass should be used. The glass will allow the metal beams to show and their designer, Tim Kennedy, has an awesome idea for overlapping the garage doors.

Commissioner Caruana confirmed the design elements would mimic the existing steel I beams that are used vertically and horizontally.

Commissioner Burns asked Staff why they recommended the lites in the roll-up doors be replaced with a solid material. Planner Ferber explained that originally, the transom lites would be divided, which looked very busy. Staff's recommendation is much more compatible and makes the roll-up doors look more like part of an industrial building instead of an addition to the building. How to fill in the transom lites has been left very open ended in the Staff report, but the design must tie into the building's original use. She agreed that making them look like boarded up windows would not be the right way to go, but there are alternatives for adding weight and texture. The divided lites originally proposed looked more like a greenhouse and the divisions looked chaotic without adding more light to the area.

Vice President Dieffenbach called for any presentations by persons in favor of the application.

Tim Kennedy, 3708 Irving, Astoria, said he got the feeling that Mr. Harris and Mr. Nemlowill did not want solid panels in the transoms. He referred to the Applicant's slideshow presentation and explained that the existing terrace has a railing system identical to what is proposed for the upper level terrace. The initial design concept was to move the existing railing system to the upper level, but structural complications made this impossible. The railing will be reused at another location. The upper level railing will be six-inch wide galvanized steel columns with a four-inch galvanized mesh screen panels between the columns. The wood cap will be three inches thick with marine varnish, just like the existing wood cap. All of the structural metal components and the overhead door to the pub are galvanized steel. Galvanized steel is a good fit for this environment because it is corrosion resistant and the grey color matches the concrete structure. The overhead doors have an aluminum



frame and there are four currently in use on the Fort George block. The Applicant's intend to use the same manufacturer for the proposed project. The entry doors at the courtyard stairs are also a repeat of other doors currently in use on the Fort George block. The doors on the upper level will have a rail in the middle at doorknob level, glass above, and an aluminum metal panel below. Initially, the structural columns were going to be six-by-six galvanized steel columns that would align with the original railing system. However, after meeting with Mr. Goodenberger, they decided on wider columns to help with mass and scale. The proposed columns will be the same width as the existing columns on the north side of Fort George. The two overhead doors on the west side facing the courtyard will have a standard lift and when open, will be at the lowest level. The overhead doors on the north and south sides will be at higher levels when open. An interesting view will be created when all of the doors are open at the same time and the glass panels are overhead. Interior lighting has not yet been determined, but there will be overhead radiant heaters. The top deck will be hard wood decking over a structural concrete deck and the ceiling surface that can be seen from underneath will be galvanized pan deck with a corrugated metal profile. The sky bridge connecting the upper level terrace with the landing for the spiral stairs will have the same railing profile used on all of the ADA ramp accesses and will not have a wood cap. The beams supporting the bridge will be 10-inch wide galvanized beams.

Roger Rocka, 362 Duane, Astoria, said he was not an architect, designer, or engineer. However, the only thing that seemed to be missing from separating the new from the old was color. Colors from the main building would not be continued on to the addition and he believed using the same colors would tie the whole project together and eliminate all of the Commission's concerns.

Vice President Dieffenbach called for any presentations by persons impartial to the application. Seeing none, she called for testimony by persons opposed to the application.

Carol Scott, 1457 Exchange, Astoria, said she just bought her home, which is located across the street from Fort George Brewery. She was concerned about what the proposed structure would do to the sounds, lighting, and the increased number of people because this could impact her quality of life and the value of her property.

Vice President Dieffenbach called for the Applicant's rebuttal.

Mr. Harris stated that no external lighting had been proposed for this project. Occasionally, there will be people out on the deck, but Fort George has always been very sensitive to their neighbors' concerns. So, after 10:00 pm the windows are closed. The garage doors will keep most of the noise down.

Mr. Nemlowill believed it was important to note that attaching a contemporary structure to a historic building is not an attempt to mimic the historic building. This is another reason he preferred the glass windows in the roll-up doors.

Vice President Dieffenbach called for closing remarks of Staff.

Planner Ferber said it was a struggle to balance compatibility between contemporary and historic.

Vice President Dieffenbach closed the public testimony portion of the hearing and called for Commission discussion and deliberation.

Commissioner Caruana believed the issue of compatibility comes up a lot. He believed the best additions were the ones that were strikingly different from the original structure. This addition could be even more different from the building, but understood massing. He noted that one horizontal galvanized rail looked out of place, but he liked the glass. The look of the addition does not take away from Fort George's architecture because it is on the side of the building. He had no issues with the application.

Commissioner Burns said everything that Fort George Brewery has done looks nice. He did not want the Applicants to fool people into thinking the addition was original and liked that it could be removed. He believed the project would fit nicely and the design was compatible. The project met the criteria and he supported the application.



Commissioner Osterberg agreed with Commissioners Caruana and Burns. He noted that color was included in the criteria for this project. However, any issues with color would not address Staff's concern or make much difference to overall compatibility. The project is compatible and Condition of Approval 1 is not necessary. He would not impose a condition that just describes how something should be different. He believed the project, as proposed, met the criteria. Therefore, he recommended Condition 1 be deleted.

Commissioner McHone believed the addition was a natural progression of the development of the property and it balanced the building very well. He supported the application.

Commissioner Rathmell believed the Applicants put a lot of consideration into the use of materials and the design. Fort George has always done a good job of maintaining the historic design of the original building and she had no issues with the project. She supported the application.

Mr. Nemlowill added that he appreciates form and function. The increase in utility of the property is amazing with the addition. The building must serve the owners and the customers, and this project does a good job of that.

Vice President Dieffenbach said she believed the project also served the community. She liked the solid material in the transoms on the roll-up doors, but she was not opposed to an open material either. She noted that SHPO recommended the solid material and asked how that affected the HLC's decision. Planner Ferber explained that SHPO reviews interior and exterior alterations for buildings under special assessment. The HLC can allow the Applicant to leave the transoms open, but the Applicant would have to work out the issue with SHPO.

Mr. Nemlowill believed if the windows were made to look more massive, the enclosure would look top heavy.

Vice President Dieffenbach said the Applicant might not be able to use the proposed design, but there are ways to make the doors more solid. She confirmed that any minor changes required by SHPO could be approved administratively, but major changes to the size and scale would be reviewed by the HLC.

Planner Ferber explained that several sections of the Staff report would need to be amended if Condition of Approval 1 were deleted.

The Commission discussed how to amend the Staff report and directed Staff to make the following changes: (Strikethrough indicates deletions and bold italics indicates additions)

- Page 7, Scale – "The massing of the structure is not as industrial or heavy as the existing structure and ~~does not meet the criteria without some alterations,~~ ***but as a new addition to the building, the structure is appropriate as a more contemporary design and fits the scale.***"
- Page 8, Character of the property – Delete the second, third, and fourth paragraphs. Add language indicating that should the design be altered through the Special Assessment Program, the alterations would have to be reviewed by the Historic Landmarks Commission and that the proposal meets the character of the property.
- Page 9, Conditions of Approval – Delete Number 1.

Commissioner Osterberg moved that the Historic Landmarks Commission (HLC) adopt the Findings and Conclusions contained in the Staff report as amended and approve Historic Designation EX17-01 by Fort George Brewery and Public House, Cervesia Gratis, Inc.; seconded by Commissioner Burns. Motion passed unanimously.

Vice President Dieffenbach read the rules of appeal into the record.

The Commission continued to Item 3: Approval of Minutes at this time.

#### REPORTS OF OFFICERS/COMMISSIONERS – ITEM 6:

There were none.

#### STATUS REPORTS – ITEM 7:

Planner Ferber and Director Cronin updated the Commission on the following:

- Historic Preservation Month events and projects
- Advance Astoria
- House Bill HB2007 related to affordable housing and historic properties
- New Fee Schedule
- Accessory Dwelling Units
- SHPO's Statewide Historic Preservation Plan meeting
- DoCoMoMo U.S. Oregon Modernism Inventory

SPECIAL ASSESSMENT REVIEW – ITEM 8:

Planner Ferber presented three Special Assessment applications, which were included in the Staff report. SHPO has asked for recommendations from the HLC.

After discussing each application, the Commission unanimously agreed to recommend that SHPO approve all three properties for Special Assessments.

MISCELLANEOUS – ITEM 9:

PUBLIC COMMENTS – ITEM 10:

ADJOURNMENT:

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned at 7:15 pm.

**APPROVED:**



\_\_\_\_\_  
Community Development Director