

## **HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION MEETING**

City Council Chambers

August 15, 2017

### CALL TO ORDER – ITEM 1:

A regular meeting of the Astoria Historic Landmarks Commission (HLC) was held at the above place at the hour of 5:15 p.m.

### ROLL CALL – ITEM 2:

Commissioners Present: President LJ Gunderson, Vice President Michelle Dieffenbach, Commissioners Paul Caruana, Kevin McHone, and Katie Rathmell.

Commissioners Excused: Jack Osterberg and Mac Burns

Staff Present: Planner Nancy Ferber and Community Development Director Kevin Cronin. The meeting is recorded and will be transcribed by ABC Transcription Services, Inc.

### APPROVAL OF MINUTES – ITEM 3(a):

President Gunderson asked if there were any changes to the minutes. Commissioner Caruana noted that on Page 2, next to last paragraph, second sentence, he believed Mr. Helligso had said the overhang on the west elevation would be twelve inches, not eight inches.

Commissioner Caruana moved to approve the minutes of July 18, 2017 as corrected; seconded by Vice President Dieffenbach. Ayes: President Gunderson, Vice President Dieffenbach, Commissioners Caruana, Rathmell, and McHone. Nays: None.

### PUBLIC HEARINGS:

President Gunderson explained the procedures governing the conduct of public hearings to the audience and advised that the substantive review criteria were listed in the Staff report.

### ITEM 4(a):

NC17-02      New Construction NC17-02 by Kathleen A. Karan to construct a 12-foot by 16-foot garage/shed and a 6-foot by 8-foot greenhouse adjacent to a historic structure at 1121 11<sup>th</sup> Street in the R-1 Low Density Residential Zone. This hearing was continued from July 18, 2017.

President Gunderson asked if anyone objected to the jurisdiction of the HLC to hear this matter at this time. There were no objections. President Gunderson asked if any member of the HLC had a conflict of interest, or any ex parte contacts to declare.

President Gunderson, Commissioner Caruana, and Commissioner McHone declared that they drove by the property.

President Gunderson requested a presentation of the Staff report.

Planner Ferber presented the Staff report and recommended approval with conditions. No correspondence has been received.

President Gunderson opened public testimony for the hearing and asked for the Applicant's presentation.

Kathy Karan, 1121 11<sup>th</sup> Street, Astoria, (via telephone) said the greenhouse would have 6-foot tall walls with a 9-foot tall roof height. She hoped to complete the project in phases, starting with the main part of the garage so that she could use the garage as a workshop to restore the house. The tool shed and bump out would be added later as the need for them arose. She did not have any plans to use the space as an accessory dwelling unit

Historic Landmarks Commission

Minutes 08-15-17

Page 1 of 3

(ADU) because currently, her house did not have the minimum square footage required to make her property eligible for an ADU. Her original project was just the garage, which had been approved by the State Historic Preservation Office (SHPO) for special assessment. However, SHPO had not yet responded to the additions to the project.

Commissioner Caruana asked if the window surrounds, corner boards, soffit, and eave details would match the house. Ms. Karan said that was her desire, but SHPO recommended simpler design details that distinguished the outbuildings from the house as new construction. She had been designing the buildings to match the house and look like they had always been there. She was surprised by SHPO's recommendation, so she did some research and found that there are four different schools of thought on the topic, including differentiating new construction from historic structures. SHPO stated the decision would be left up to the HLC. She preferred matching details, but if she needed to distinguish the new construction, she could add a sign to the house stating the year it was built. Also, the garage would have a cement floor, which would identify the garage as a new structure because garages had dirt floors 100 years ago.

Commissioner Caruana said he would like the structures to match as closely as possible, mainly the siding, fascias, barge, and corner boards.

Commissioner Rathmell confirmed that 8-lite windows would be used on the greenhouse, the 6-lite windows would be used on the bump out, and the three, double-hung windows would go on the opposite side of the garage.

President Gunderson noted that no members of the public were present to give testimony and called for closing remarks from Staff.

Planner Ferber asked if the matching design details should be added as a condition of approval or left up to the Applicant to work out with SHPO.

President Gunderson closed the public testimony portion of the hearing and called for Commission discussion and deliberation.

Commissioner Caruana said the details shown in the drawings for the new structure need to match the house, as submitted. No details need to be added to what was submitted.

Vice President Dieffenbach believed the proposal looked appropriate. The buildings would be located at the back of the lot and not visible from the adjacent house. She had no issues with the request, but agreed the details should match the house.

Commissioner Rathmell agreed this would be a good project.

Commissioner McHone said he liked that the windows would be recycled.

Planner Ferber recommended the Commission add an eighth condition of approval stating that "overhangs, gables, eaves shown in the proposed drawings shall match the existing single-family dwelling."

Commissioner Caruana said he would be in favor any additional details matching the house, like gable detailing or knee brace detailing. Vice President Dieffenbach suggested requiring any additional details to match the house.

Commissioner Caruana moved that the Historic Landmarks Commission (HLC) adopt the Findings and Conclusions contained in the Staff report and approve New Construction NC17-02 by Kathleen A. Karan, with the following additional condition of approval:

- Overhangs, gables, eaves, corner boards, and window trim shown in the proposed drawings and any additional details shall match the existing single-family dwelling.

Seconded by Commissioner McHone. Motion passed unanimously.

President Gunderson read the rules of appeal into the record.



#### REPORTS OF OFFICERS/COMMISSIONERS – ITEM 5:

Commissioner Caruana commented that work was being done on various properties at the east end of Astoria. He asked if work other than painting would need to be reviewed by the HLC. He had seen that siding was removed from one of the bars directly across from the historic fire station.

Staff confirmed that some projects might not be required to be reviewed by the HLC. Commercial buildings need a building permit to install new siding, but not an HLC review if the building is not historic or is not a compatible resource. In the case of the bar, the building official had to ask the business to apply for a permit after the siding work had already begun. Therefore, the business's fees were doubled.

The Commission and Staff discussed other renovation projects going on in Astoria.

#### STATUS REPORTS – ITEM 6:

Planner Ferber updated the Commission on NC16-03 at 12<sup>th</sup> and Grand, which had been completed.

#### MISCELLANEOUS – ITEM 7:

##### **Item 7(a): Refresher on historic window permitting requirements**

Planner Ferber reviewed Development Code requirements and criteria for reviewing and approving windows. Staff answered questions about enforcement, homeowner requirements versus business requirements, and the consequences of failing to apply for a permit.

Planner Ferber noted that there were five permits on the agenda for September so far. She would also provide updated on CLG projects.

#### PUBLIC COMMENTS – ITEM 8:

There were none.

#### ADJOURNMENT:

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned at 6:00 pm.

#### **APPROVED:**

  
\_\_\_\_\_  
City Planner